



GADLINESS IN THE PHILIPPINE NATIONAL POLICE

Dr. Alvin T. Dulin, Faculty Member, College of Criminal Justice Administration, Cagayan State University, Piat Campus, Piat, Cagayan, Philippines

Dr. Maita LP. Guadamor, Faculty Member, College of Criminal Justice Administration, Cagayan State University, Piat Campus, Cagayan, Philippines

Joey R. Pascua, MSCrim, Faculty Member, College of Criminal Justice Administration, Cagayan State University, Piat Campus, Piat, Cagayan, Philippines

Jim E. Eusebio, MSCrim, Faculty Member, College of Criminal Justice Administration, Cagayan State University, Piat Campus, Piat, Cagayan, Philippines

Abstract: *This study evaluates the implementation of Gender and Development (GAD) in the Philippine National Police in Cagayan to shed light on the status of gender issues, especially on women in this male dominated agency. The bases of evaluation are the several government mandates and laws relative to GAD as assessed by the different PNP Members being the recipients of the Gender and Development Programs of PNP. The study covers 28 towns and involves 490 respondents comprising of 193 male Police Non-commissioned Officers (PNCOs), 91 Non-uniformed Personnel (NUPs), 171 Women Police Service (WPS), 28 Chiefs of Police (COPs), and 7 branch chiefs. The over-all assessment reveal that PNP Cagayan is generally GAD compliant to the provisions of Republic Act 7192, Memorandum Circular No. 48 Series of 2013, Magna Carta for Women, Republic Act No. 10352, PCW Memorandum Circular No. 2011-01, NPC Memorandum Circular No. 2003 -004, and Republic Act 8551 except for few indicators that need special attention. The descriptive research method is utilized in the study employing survey and interview. This study was presented, approved and funded by the Cagayan State University in response to its thrust for gender awareness and development programs.*

Keywords: *Gender and Development, gender issues in the law enforcement, Philippine National Police, Magna Carta for Women, Republic Act 7192, and Memorandum Circulars*

INTRODUCTION

In the male dominated profession of law enforcement, women are vulnerable to be underrepresented, undermined, or underutilized. On the other hand, their male counterparts' roles can be too much exhausted or misused and their other potentials may



not be given full opportunities to become more productive. These are issues that usually get the least attention and priority or none at all but are vital in the functionality and development of law enforcement agencies which include the Philippine National Police.

The government has initiated efforts to address these gender problems by mandating different agencies to mainstream or institutionalize gender and development.

The Magna Carta of Women established in 2006 through Republic Act 9710 is a comprehensive women's human rights law that seeks to eliminate discrimination through the recognition, protection, fulfillment and promotion of the rights of Filipino women, especially those belonging in the marginalized sectors of the society. It conveys a local framework of rights for women based directly on international law such as the Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women's (CEDAW). Some salient features of the law include the increased number of women in third level positions in government to achieve a fifty-fifty (50-50) gender balance, at least 40% women in all levels of development planning and program implementation, non-discrimination in employment in the field of military, police and other similar services that include according the same promotional privileges and opportunities as their men counterpart. The MCW mandates all government offices, including government-owned and controlled corporations and local government units to adopt gender mainstreaming as a strategy for implementing the law and attaining its objectives.

Another is Republic Act 7192 or the Women in Development and Nation Building Act. This act expresses that the State recognizes the role of women in nation building and shall ensure the fundamental equality before the law of women and men. It also says that the State shall provide women rights and opportunities equal to that of men. Section 4 Numbers 3 and 4 in this act states that the NEDA, with the assistance of the National Commission on the Role of Filipino Women, shall ensure that the different government departments, including its agencies and instrumentalities which, directly or indirectly, affect the participation of women in national development and their integration therein should ensure the active participation of women and women's organizations in the development programs and/or projects including their involvement in the planning, design, implementation, management, monitoring and evaluation thereof and assist women in activities that are of critical significance to their self-reliance and development. Moreover, Section 7 which deals



on Admission to Military Schools states that any provision of the law to the contrary notwithstanding, consistent with the needs of the services, women shall be accorded equal opportunities for appointment, admission, training, graduation and commissioning in all military or similar schools of the Armed Forces of the Philippines and the Philippine National Police not later than the fourth academic year following the approval of this Act in accordance with the standards required for men except for those minimum essential adjustments required by physiological differences between sexes.

In addition, the Philippine Council for Women released Memorandum Circular No. 2011-01 sets the general guidelines in the implementation of the Gender and Development Focal Point System to wit: (d) Agencies shall develop GAD capacity development programs that support continuing gender education, updating and enhancing skills customized according to the functions of the GAD Focal Point System (GFPS), to be integrated in the regular agency Human Resource Development Plan; (f) Funds shall be allocated for programs, activities and projects to support the organization, management and operations of the GFPS, to be charged to the agency's GAD budget.

Moreover, the National Police Commission (NPC) Memorandum Circular No. 2003 -004 provides the guidelines in establishing PNP Gender and Development (GAD) mechanisms to ensure that GAD concerns of the PNP and its clientele are recognized and addressed. Guideline 1 in this memorandum titled 'Organizational Functions of the PNP Focal Points' states that the PNP GAD Focal Point shall be constituted at the national, regional, provincial levels including the equivalent offices of the latter, the district and highly urbanized city police offices. Letter D under this guideline also states that the City/Municipal Police Office GAD Focal Point/Officer should ensure that GAD concerns and issues affecting PNP personnel and clients at the city and municipal levels are addressed and that the Chief of Police shall designate the head of the Women and Children's Protection Desk (WCPD) or a police officer who has undergone Gender Sensitivity Training as the GAD Focal Point Officer. Additionally, the city/municipal office GAD Focal Point Officer shall among others (1) Identify and initiate resolution of gender issues and concerns that affect municipal/city personnel and clientele; (2) Ensure that GAD related information and directives emanating from the national, regional, provincial and other higher level GAD Focal Points are disseminated and/or implemented in the city/municipal office/s; (3) Submit for inclusion in



the PNP Annual GAD Plan through the Provincial GAD Focal Point project proposals or plans that address concerns or issues peculiar to the area. (4) Establish linkages with GAD Focal Points of Local and National Government Offices, and local NGO's which advocate gender and development; and (5) Submit regular GAD Accomplishment reports and other GAD Report as required to the Provincial or other higher level GAD Focal Point.

Last is the Republic Act No. 8551 which defines the Creation of Women's Desks in All Police Stations and the Formulation of a Gender Sensitivity Program. Section 57 of this Act particularizes the creation and functions of the Women's Desk. It posits that the PNP shall establish women's desks in all police stations throughout the country to administer and attend to cases involving crimes against chastity, sexual harassment, abuses committed against women and children and other similar offenses provided that municipalities and cities presently without policewomen will have two (2) years upon the effectivity of this Act within which to comply with the requirement of this provision. For this, section 58 stipulates the 'Prioritization of Women for Recruitment.' It says that within the next five (5) years then on, the PNP shall prioritize the recruitment and training of women who shall serve in the women's desk. Pursuant to this requirement, the PNP shall reserve ten percent (10%) of its annual recruitment, training, and education quota for women.

Focusing on Gender Sensitivity Program, Section 59 of this Act states that the Commission shall formulate a gender sensitivity program within ninety (90) days from the effectivity of this Act to include but not limited to the establishment of equal opportunities for women in the PNP, the prevention of sexual harassment in the workplace, and the prohibition of discrimination on the basis of gender or sexual orientation. Section 60 details out that any personnel who shall violate the established rules and regulations regarding gender sensitivity and gender equality shall be suspended without pay for not less than thirty (30) days and shall undergo gender sensitivity seminar or training provided that any personnel who violates the rules more than twice shall be recommended for demotion or dismissal from the PNP.

All of these laws are expected to be in full implementation in the Philippine National Police; however, the extent to which these are being implemented is observably underrated and may have not been given full attention and implementation. This poses more tolls on the



prevailing gender bias problems in the agency. For instance, the male and female roles may have not been fully defined or may have been consistently questionable.

Given these premises, this study proves timely and relevant.

METHODOLOGY

The study utilized the Descriptive Research Method. This is the collection of data in order to test theory of the current status of subjects of the study including the discovery of their relationships (Kerlinagn, 1973). This was used in the study to qualitatively describe the perceived assessment and evaluation of the respondents on the implementation of Gender and Development in PNP Cagayan and their relationships. The researchers used triangulation to confirm and substantiate the data. The study was conducted in the 29 municipal police stations of the Province of Cagayan and it had a total of 490 respondents comprising of 171 Women Police Service (WPS), 28 Chiefs of Police (COPs), and 7 branch chiefs selected through total enumeration and 193 male Police Non-commissioned Officers (PNCOs) and 91 Non-uniformed Personnel (NUPs) selected through stratified sampling.

Two sets of questionnaires were constructed. The first set was used to gather data about the perceived assessment of the male PNCOs, WPS and NUPs in the implementation of Gender and Development in PNP Cagayan. The second set was used to identify the COPs and section heads' perception on the level of implementation of Gender and Development in PNP Cagayan. This questionnaire was based on different provisions of GAD mandated by the government and which are applicable to the Philippine National Police. Each of the sets also surveyed the profile of the respondents.

The following scale was used to analyze the data on the assessment of the WPS, NUPs and male PNCOs on the implementation of GAD in PNP Cagayan based on their mean scores.

4.20 – 5.0	Strongly agree
3.40 – 4.19-	Agree
2.60 – 3.39-	Neither agree nor disagree
1.80 – 2.59-	Disagree
1.0 – 1.79	Strongly disagree

On the other hand, the perceived level of implementation of the GAD policies and mandates in PNP Cagayan was analyzed using the following scale.

4.20 – 5.0	Fully implemented
------------	-------------------



3.40 – 4.19-	Partially implemented
2.60 – 3.39-	Moderately implemented
1.80 – 2.59-	Rarely implemented
1.0 – 1.79	Never implemented

ANOVA was used to compute for the difference in the perceived assessment of the implementation of Gender and Development in PNP Cagayan among the male PNCOs, WPS, and NUPs.

RESULTS AND DISCUSSIONS

Table 1. Sex and Gender of the Respondents

Category	Frequency	Percentage
Male	259	53
Female	231	47
Total	490	100
Category	Frequency	Percentage
Straight Male	152	45.37
Gay	3	.90
Bisexual	0	0
Straight Female	178	53.13
Lesbian	2	.60
Transgender	0	0
Total	335	100

The Profile of the Respondents. Table 1 presents the profile of the members of the PNP. It shows that majority of the respondents are male, numbering to 259 or 53 percent. On the other hand, there are 231 females consisting 47 percent of the total number of respondents. It further shows that only 335 respondents disclose their gender. Among these, 152 or 45.37 percent reveal that they are ‘straight male’ while 178 or 53.13% reveal that they are ‘straight female.’ Three respondents or 0.90 percent claim that they are ‘gay’ and two or 0.60 percent of the respondents disclose that they are ‘lesbians.’ None among the respondents admitted they are bisexual or transgender. The other 129 respondents did not reveal their gender.

Regarding the issue of gays in law enforcement, the researchers also included one item in the interview which asked the respondents “Are gays needed in PNP?” Both female and male respondents affirm that gays are also needed because they can give important contribution in the law enforcement due to their special skills, talents, and creativity.



Table 2. Educational Attainment of the Respondents

Educational Attainment	Male	Female	Total	Percentage
W/ College Units	0	0	0	0
College Degree	254	220	474	96.73
Master's Degree	5	11	16	3.2
Doctor's Degree	0	0	0	0
Total	259	231	490	100

Educational Attainment of the Respondents. Table 2 gives details on the respondents' educational attainment. It shows that 474 or 96.73 percent of the respondents are college graduates among which 254 are male and 220 are female. It also shows that 16 or 3.27 percent of the respondents are master's degree holders among which 5 are male and 11 are female. Given these figures, it is evident that the female employees of PNP have more interest to pursue higher education than the male employees.

Table 3. The Ranks of the Male Police Non-commissioned Officers (PNCOs) and Women

Police Service (WPS)

Ranks	POI	POII	POIII	SPOI	SPOII	SPOIII	SPOIV	TOTAL
PNCOs	54	54	31	19	16	3	16	193
WPS	41	34	42	19	19	10	6	171
Total	96	87	73	38	35	13	22	364
Percentage	26%	24%	20%	10%	10%	4%	6%	100%

Ranks of the Male Police Non-commissioned Officers (PNCOs) and Women Police Service (WPS). Shown in Table 3 are the ranks of the male PNCOs and WPS. Among the 364 respondents, 26 percent or 96 are Police Officer I, 24 percent or 87 are Police Officer II, 20 percent or 73 are Police Officer III, 10 percent or 38 are Senior Police Officer I, 10 percent or 35 are Senior Police Officer II, 4 percent or 13 are Senior Police Officer III and 6 percent or 22 are Senior Police Officer IV. It can be inferred that the male PNCO's mostly occupy the higher ranks although it is noteworthy that the WPS are also given the opportunity to move up the ranks, thereby promoting equality.

The Gender Roles of the Respondents. Women are mostly confined to administrative tasks and light duty office works. In the interview, respondents reveal that women are usually in charge in handling Violence against Women and their Children (VAWC) cases, Police Community Relations (PCR) activities, paper works, school visits, child abuse cases, and administrative tasks. Furthermore, women in PNP admit that they assume responsibility to



do hospitality work such as entertaining visitors of the office, serving food, and providing civil relations. They also expose that they cannot join traffic patrol and combat operations. During the interview, some women expressed their wish to join in combat operations given that they are also trained to conduct such activities.

The Gender and Development Policies in PNP Cagayan. Based on the interviews conducted with the section head of the Family, Juvenile and Gender and Development (FJGAD) in PNP Cagayan, there are no specific policies to implement gender and development that are initiated by their agency. Instead, they apply rulings released by the National Police Commission and other government agencies like the Philippine Women’s Commission. They also apply other related laws in line with Gender and Development. This is so because the provincial office does not have autonomy over policy formulations; hence, it can only comply to policies that emanate from the abovementioned national agencies.

The Gender and Development Programs and Activities in PNP Cagayan. Interviews with the FJGAD Officers reveal that the common GAD related programs of the police stations in Cagayan are seminar on VAWC in barangays in partnership with the Local Government Unit (LGU), gender awareness and sensitivity seminar/symposium, medical missions and feeding programs, seminar on Republic Act 9262 and Republic Act 7610, counseling sessions, women’s month celebration, women empowerment activities, dialogue with organized women in the different barangays, and support to Day Care Centers with the Municipal Social Welfare and Development Officer (MSWDO).

Additionally, women in PNP Cagayan also reveal that they are members of Women’s Club or WPS Club; however, they have no or very limited participation and they rarely become recipients of these organizations nor have attended any activity initiated by this organization. They add that aside from women empowerment seminars and socializations, there are no other means by which they are directly benefited from the Gender and Development Fund. The same is true to the men.

Table 4. The Assessment of Male PNCOs, WPS, and NUPs on the Implementation of GAD in PNP Cagayan

GAD Compliance Indicators	Male Police Non-Commissioned Officers (PNCOs)	Women Police Service (WPS)	Non-Uniformed Personnel (NUPs)



	Mean	Adjectival Value	Mean	Adjectival Value	Mean	Adjectival Value
1. I feel that my basic needs in fulfilling my duties in my work assignment are provided.	4.11	Agree	4.08	Agree	2.98	Neither agree nor disagree
2. The agency recognizes all my talents and skills in law enforcement and I am able to use it productively.	2.57	Disagree	3.22	Neither agree nor disagree	2.70	Neither agree nor disagree
3. I think that the promotion process of the agency is gender-fair.	2.93	Neither agree nor disagree	2.96	Neither agree nor disagree	3.72	Agree
4. I believe that the agency practices fair hiring procedures.	3.72	Agree	3.84	Agree	2.82	Neither agree nor disagree
5. I think that none of my rights are violated because of some policies in the agency.	2.97	Neither agree nor disagree	2.96	Neither agree nor disagree	3.98	Agree
6. I am capable of doing my present tasks in my position.	4.11	Agree	4.22	Agree	3.60	Agree
7. I believe that the agency is gender-sensitive.	3.63	Agree	3.48	Agree	4.07	Agree
8. I feel that I am developing my full potential in my work place.	4.10	Agree	4.09	Agree	3.54	Agree
9. I think that there is already enough number of female workers in the law enforcement to handle gender-sensitive issues and violence against women and their children.	3.75	Agree	3.67	Neither agree nor disagree	4.14	Agree
10. I am given full assistance in coping with my difficulties in doing my job.	3.89	Agree	3.99	Agree	3.88	Agree
11. I receive grants and incentives the same with my female/male counterparts.	3.81	Agree	3.94	Agree	2.41	Disagree
12. I think that there are enough women representatives during planning sessions in the agency.	2.41	Disagree	2.56	Disagree	3.86	Agree
13. I am sent to trainings equal to my male/female counterparts.	3.89	Agree	4.10	Agree	4.14	Agree
14. I am comfortable in my	4.18	Agree	4.14	Agree	4.08	Agree



work place.						
15. I can work conveniently in my work place.	4.05	Agree	4.11	Agree	3.78	Agree
16. I participate in decision making and policy-making in the workplace.	3.89	Agree	3.96	Agree	3.55	Agree
17. There is a proper venue in my workplace where I can express my problems regarding sexuality.	3.65	Agree	3.81	Agree	3.72	Agree
18. I can freely express my opinions within the organization.	3.93	Agree	3.85	Agree	4.01	Agree
19. I feel that I am dignified in my present position.	4.01	Agree	4.05	Agree	3.94	Agree
20. I never felt discriminated on the basis of my gender.	4.00	Agree	4.12	Agree	3.86	Agree
21. I never felt discriminated because of my economic and physical status.	3.92	Agree	3.98	Agree	4.22	Agree
22. I believe that men and women have equal employment opportunity in the law enforcement.	4.00	Agree	4.17	Agree	3.23	Neither agree nor disagree
23. I am a member of an internal organization/union which helps me voice out my work-related problems.	3.27	Neither agree nor disagree	3.51	Agree	3.81	Agree
24. I felt benefited by the Gender and Development programs, activities and projects in my agency.	3.88	Agree	4.02	Agree	4.12	Agree
25. I know whom to approach in the agency in case I need advice regarding my rights.	4.11	Agree	4.08	Agree	4.20	Agree
26. I feel totally safeguarded in the workplace because the agency provides means to keep me safe.	4.07	Agree	4.12	Agree	4.18	Agree
27. I have full knowledge of my rights and my agency is continuing to educate me about it.	4.06	Agree	4.18	Agree	3.9	Agree
28. I am well-informed about the GAD policies, programs and projects in PNP.	3.99	Agree	4.11	Agree	4.02	Agree



29. My agency helps me understand equality between men and women employees and their differences too, regarding gender-related issues.	3.95	Agree	4.19	Agree	4.20	Agree
30. There is equality and fairness among all employees in the PNP.	4.08	Agree	4.25	Strongly agree	3.76	Agree
Overall Weighted Mean	3.73	Agree	3.89	Agree	4.01	Agree

The Assessment of Male Police Non-commissioned Officers (PNCOs), Women Police Service (WPS and Non-Commissioned Officers (NUPs) on the Implementation of Gender and Development in PNP Cagayan. Table 4 reflects that male PNCOs generally ‘agree’ that PNP Cagayan is GAD compliant with an overall weighted mean of 3.73. Specifically, they agree that they are comfortable in their workplace with the highest mean of 4.18. Among others, they also ‘agree’ that they feel that their basic needs in fulfilling their duties in their work assignments are provided; that they are capable in doing their tasks in their position; and that they know whom to approach in the agency in case they need advice regarding their rights which have the same mean of 4.11 moreover, they also agree that their full potential is being developed in their work place with the mean of 4.10.

In spite of this, the male PNCOs ‘disagree’ on some indicators. Indicators 2 and 12 that have the mean of 2.57 and 2.41 respectively, reveal that male PNCOs have underutilized or unrecognized skills and talents in law enforcement and that there is no enough women representatives during planning sessions in the agency.

Additionally, it is worth noting that indicators rated ‘neither agree nor disagree’ imply reservation or unawareness on the part of the male PNCOs about these particular rights, privileges or knowledge, although these generally imply neutral responses. Common causes for neutralities such as this are disorientation, misbelief, threat or subordination. Johns (2010) explains that respondents may “use the midpoint to avoid reporting what they see as less socially acceptable answer”.

In this study, the respondents show hesitance in revealing their exact stand if the promotion process of the agency is fair to all genders with the mean of 2.93. They also don’t reveal whether none of their rights are violated because of some policies in the agency with a mean of 2.97. The respondents are also uncertain if they belong to an internal



organization/union to help them voice out their work-related problems with the mean of 3.27. This connotes that they have not been involved in their organization nor they have participated in it.

The Assessment of Women Police Service (WPS) on the Implementation of Gender and Development in PNP Cagayan. Table 4 shows that the WPS generally ‘agree’ that PNP Cagayan is GAD compliant with an overall weighted mean of 3.89. Among the indicators, they rated one indicator ‘strongly agree’ with the mean of 4.25, which states that there is equality and fairness among all employees in PNP.

The table further shows that they ‘agree’ that they are capable of doing their tasks in their present position with the highest mean of 4.22. They also ‘agree’ that their agency helps them understand equality between men and women employees and their differences regarding gender-related issues with the mean of 4.19; that they have full knowledge of their rights and their agency is continuing to educate them about it with the mean of 4.18; and that they believe that men and women have equal employment opportunity in the law enforcement with the mean of 4.17.

On the other hand, the women police ‘disagree’ that there are already enough women representatives during planning sessions in the agency with the mean of 2.56.

Moreover, because this research is for the protection of the vulnerable few, the researchers claim that the indicators that drew neutral responses from the women police statistically described as ‘neither agree nor disagree’ offer more than just being interpreted that they are unaware about the indicator or hesitant to reveal their true stand about these. Rather, these flag viable data that should be considered such as the percentage of the responses in these indicators to reveal important findings. Table 5 presents the percentage of the total responses under each indicator.

Table 5. Percentage Distribution of the Assessment of WPS on Selected GAD Implementation Indicators that Are Rated ‘Neither Agree nor Disagree’

GAD Compliance Indicators	PERCENTAGE RATING					Total
	Strongly Disagree	Dis- Agree	Neither Agree nor Disagree	Agree	Strongly Agree	
3. I think that the promotion process of the agency is gender fair.	4.3	27.3	30	31	7.4	100%



5. I think that none of my rights are violated because of some policies in the agency.	6.8	24.7	34	27	7.5	100%
--	-----	------	----	----	-----	------

Looking at indicator 3, it is worth emphasizing that a significant number of the women police (27.3 percent) ‘disagree’ that the promotion process of the agency is gender-fair while an additional 4.3 percent of them ‘strongly disagree’ to it. Also, the percentage of those who agree and strongly agree for indicator 5 combined which is equal to 31.5 percent is enough to conclude that indeed some rights of the women police are violated because of some policies in the agency.

The Assessment Rating of Non-uniformed Personnel (NUP) on the Implementation of Gender and Development in PNP Cagayan. Table 4 shows that the NUPs generally ‘agree’ that PNP Cagayan is GAD compliant with the mean of 3.76. Particularly, the NUPs ‘agree’ that men and women have equal opportunities in the law enforcement which has the highest mean of 4.22. They also ‘agree’ that they feel totally safeguarded in the workplace because the agency provides means to keep them safe and that there is equality between men and women employees in PNP which have the same mean of 4.20. They also reveal that they ‘agree’ that they have full knowledge of their rights and their agency is continuing to educate them about it with the mean of 4.18; that they are given full assistance in coping with their difficulties in doing their job and that they are comfortable in their workplace with the same mean of 4.14. Moreover, the NUPs ‘disagree’ that there are already enough women representatives during planning sessions in their agency with the mean of 2.41. Furthermore, though rated ‘neither agree nor disagree’ by the respondents, the researchers contend that the percentage data can be used to explain further the implications of indicators. These are presented in Table 6.

Table 6. Percentage Distribution of the Assessment of NUP on Selected GAD Implementation Indicators that Are Rated ‘Neither Agree nor Disagree’

GAD Compliance Indicators	PERCENTAGE RATING					Total
	Strongly Disagree	Dis-agree	Neither Agree nor Disagree	Agree	Strongly Agree	
2. The agency recognizes my talents and skills in law enforcement and I am able to use these productively.	3.6	20.6	51	20	4.8	100 %



3. I think that the promotion process of the agency is gender-fair.	2	18	40	27	13	100 %
5. I think that none of my rights are violated because of some policies in the agency.	6	28	19	36	11	100 %
23. I am a member of an internal organization/union which helps me voice out my work-related problems.	7.2	19	25	40	8.8	100 %

Based on the percentage, some NUPs claim that they have talents and skills in law enforcement, which are unrecognized with 20.6 percent who ‘disagree’ and 3.6 percent who ‘strongly disagree.’ Also, 18 percent disagree and 2 percent strongly disagree that the promotion process of the agency is gender-fair. Moreover, 28 percent ‘disagree’ while 6 percent ‘strongly disagree’ that none of their rights are violated because of some policies in the agency.

Also, 40 percent of the NUPs agree and 8.8 percent strongly agree that they are not members of an internal organization/union which helps them voice out their work-related problems.

The Difference in the Assessment of Male PNCOs, WPS, and NUPs on the Implementation of Gender and Development in PNP Cagayan. Table 7 shows the ANOVA results for the difference in the assessment of male PNCOs, WPS, and NUPs on the implementation of Gender and Development in PNP Cagayan. It shows that there is no significant difference among the groups’ assessment. Hence, the three groups tend to experience the same scenarios and receive the same treatments and conditions in their workplace along the implementation of Gender and Development in PNP.

Table 7. ANOVA Results for the Difference in the Assessment of Male PNCOs, WPS, and NUPs on the Implementation of Gender and Development in PNP Cagayan

Source	Sum of Square	Df	Mean Squares	F-Ratio	Critical Value	Decision
Treatment	0.59150	2	0.295752	1.95	.1432	Not Significant
Error	68.48108	452	0.151507			
Total	69.07259	454				

The Implementation Level of the GAD in PNP Cagayan. Table 8 reflects that PNP Cagayan ‘fully implements’ the GAD provisions of government released mandates with the overall



weighted mean of 4.36. Though this is the case, there are still some indicators that were rated 'partially implemented'

On Magna Carta for Women

The table reveals that most of the GAD provisions of the Magna Carta are fully implemented in PNP Cagayan. Specifically, the middle level managers agree that PNP Cagayan 'fully implements' Magna Carta for Women on providing the same promotional privileges and opportunities to women employees as their men counterparts, including pay increases, additional benefits, and awards, based on competency and quality of performance and on providing benefits such as leave benefits for women employees who undergo surgery caused by gynecological disorders with the same mean of 4.66, the highest mean among all the indicators. Also with the same mean of 4.55 or 'fully implemented', PNP Cagayan promotes non-discrimination of women during employment and gives women officers equal access to education, scholarships and trainings. Moreover, the middle level managers reveal that PNP Cagayan adopts gender mainstreaming as a strategy to promote women's human rights and eliminate gender discrimination in its systems, structures, policies, programs, processes, and procedures with the mean of 4.50 or 'fully implemented.'

On the other hand, two indicators are only partially implemented which are indicator 1, which states that the agency has women occupying thirds level positions having the mean of 4.16, and indicator 2, which states that there are women representatives during all levels of development planning having the mean of 4.22.

On Republic Act 7192- Women in Development and Nation Building Act

In terms of PNP Cagayan's compliance to Republic Act 7192 or the "Women in Development and Nation Building Act," the middle level managers reveal that all of the indicators are fully implemented.

The indicator that has the highest mean of 4.72 is that the women in PNP Cagayan are accorded equal opportunities for appointment, admission, training, graduation and commissioning in the agency followed by the indicators which states that the agency assists women in activities that are of critical significance to their self-reliance and development with the mean of 4.66; that the agency supports programs and activities for women and that the agency allows women and women's organizations to participate in the development programs and/or projects and to involve in the planning, design,



implementation, management, monitoring and evaluation thereof with the same mean of 4.61 and that the agency has reviewed and revised the agency's policies that are gender bias with the mean of 4.55.

On Republic Act No. 10352 - General Appropriations Act of 2013

On compliance to the General Appropriations Act of 2013, the middle level respondents reveal that PNP Cagayan 'fully implements' the provision of Republic Act No. 10352 which requires the agency to formulate a Gender and Development (GAD) Plan designed to address gender issues within its operations with the mean of 4.50. On the other hand, they believe that the other provision which states that at least five percent of the agency's budget is allocated and utilized in GAD activities, programs, and projects is only 'partially implemented' with the mean of 4.11.

On Philippine Council for Women (PCW) Memorandum Circular No. 2011-01

When it comes to PNP Cagayan's compliance to the provisions of the Philippine Council for Women (PCW) Memorandum No. 2011-01, the middle level managers admit that all indicators are only 'partially implemented.' This means that the agency needs to better the establishment of the GAD Focal Point System (GFPS) or a similar GAD mechanism to catalyze and accelerate gender mainstreaming within the agency and that the agency has to further develop programs that support continuing gender education and enhancement of the skills that are customized according to the functions of the GFPS, integrated in the regular agency Human Resource Development Plan with the same mean of 4.16. The agency also has to improve on the full allocation of GAD funds to programs, activities, and projects to support the organization, management, and operations of the GFPS which has the lowest mean of 4.05.

On National Police Commission (NPC) Memorandum Circular No. 2003 -004

The middle-level officials of PNP Cagayan reveal that their agency has not fully implemented all the provisions of the National Police Commissions (NPC) Memorandum Circular No. 2003-004.

Among those that they rated 'fully implemented, the indicators that has the highest mean of 4.61 is that the agency implements policies that ensure the prevention of sexual harassment in the workplace followed by the indicators which states that the agency carries out a policy which prevents prohibition and discrimination on the basis of gender or sexual



orientation with mean of 4.50; that the agency ensures participation of both men and women in the programs/activities/projects by deliberately counting in their concerns as partners in development and that the agency conducts gender awareness and sensitivity trainings with the same mean of 4.44.

Among those that the middle level managers rated 'partially implemented' is that each municipal police station has a GAD Focal Point Officer with the lowest mean of 3.88; that the agency initiates resolutions of gender issues and concerns that affect personnel and their relationships and that there is a system of reporting and recording GAD related issues and documents to maintain an active GAD database with the second lowest and the same mean of 4.05.

On Republic Act 8551

The last indicator which is a provision of Republic Act 8551, which states that the agency prioritizes the recruitment and training of women who shall serve in the women's desk, is rated 'fully implemented' with the mean of 4.38.

Table 8. The Implementation Level of Gender and Development in PNP Cagayan

Indicators Based on Indicated Mandates	Mean	Descriptive Value
Magna Carta for Women	4.47	Fully implemented
1. The agency has women occupying third level positions.	4.16	Partially implemented
2. There are women representatives during all levels of development planning.	4.22	Partially implemented
3. The agency provides benefits such as leave benefits for women employees who undergo surgery caused by gynecological disorders.	4.66	Fully implemented
4. The agency promotes non-discrimination of women during employment.	4.55	Fully implemented
5. The agency provides the same promotional privileges and opportunities to women employees as their men counterparts, including pay increases, additional benefits, and awards, based on competency and quality of performance.	4.66	Fully implemented
6. Women officers are given equal access to education, scholarships and trainings.	4.55	Fully implemented
7. Female officers are given chances to depict or represent the law enforcement in media campaigns.	4.44	Fully implemented
8. The agency adopts gender mainstreaming as a strategy to promote women's human rights and eliminate	4.50	Fully implemented



gender discrimination in its systems, structures, policies, programs, processes, and procedures.		
Weighted Mean	4.47	Fully implemented
Republic Act 7192 "Women in Development and Nation Building Act"		
9. Women are accorded equal opportunities for appointment, admission, training, graduation and commissioning in the agency.	4.72	Fully implemented
10. The agency supports programs and activities for women.	4.61	Fully implemented
11. The agency has reviewed and revised the agency's policies that are gender bias.	4.55	Fully implemented
12. The agency assists women in activities that are of critical significance to their self-reliance and development.	4.66	Fully implemented
13. The agency allows women and women's organizations to participate in the development programs and/or projects and to involve in the planning, design, implementation, management, monitoring and evaluation thereof.	4.61	Fully implemented
Weighted Mean	4.63	Fully implemented
Republic Act No. 10352 "General Appropriations Act of 2013"	4.31	Fully implemented
14. The agency formulates a Gender and Development (GAD) Plan designed to address gender issues within its operations.	4.50	Fully implemented
15. At least five percent (5%) of the agency's budget is allocated and utilized in GAD activities, programs and projects.	4.11	Partially implemented
	4.31	Fully implemented
Philippine Council for Women Memorandum No. 2011-01		
16. The agency has established a GAD Focal Points System (GFPS) or a similar GAD mechanism to catalyze and accelerate gender mainstreaming within the agency.	4.16	Partially implemented
17. The agency has developed GAD capacity development programs that support continuing gender education and enhancement of skills that are customized according to the functions of the GFPS, integrated in the regular agency Human Resource Development Plan.	4.16	Partially implemented
18. Funds are allocated for programs, activities and projects to support the organization, management and operations of the GFPS.	4.05	Partially implemented
Weighted Mean	4.12	Partially implemented



NPC Memorandum Circular No. 2003 -004 “Guidelines in Establishing PNP Gender and Development (GAD) Mechanisms to Ensure that GAD Concerns of the PNP and Its Clientele are Recognized and Addressed”		
19. The agency initiates resolutions of gender issues and concerns that affect personnel and their relationships.	4.05	Partially implemented
20. Each municipal police station has a GAD Focal Point Officer.	3.88	Partially implemented
21. There is a feedback mechanism to reveal and collect gender issues in the agency.	4.11	Partially implemented
22. GAD related information and directives emanating from national, regional, provincial and other higher level GAD focal points are well disseminated.	4.38	Fully implemented
23. A technical secretariat for GAD monitors, evaluates and implements GAD programs and projects in the agency.	4.11	Partially implemented
24. There is a system of reporting and recording GAD related issues and documents to maintain an active GAD database.	4.05	Partially implemented
25. There is a women organization for both uniformed and non-uniformed employees.	4.22	Partially implemented
26. The agency has an Annual GAD Plan.	4.22	Partially implemented
27. The agency ensures participation of both men and women in the programs/activities/projects by deliberately counting in their concerns as partners in development.	4.44	Fully implemented
28. The agency implements policies that ensure the prevention of sexual harassment in the workplace.	4.61	Fully implemented
29. The agency carries out a policy which prevents prohibition and discrimination on the basis of gender or sexual orientation.	4.50	Fully implemented
30. The agency applies a policy which ensures equal opportunity for policemen and policewomen in recruitment, training, schooling, promotion and assignment to all aspects of police work such as investigation and intelligence.	4.27	Fully implemented
31. The agency implements a policy that male and female PNP personnel in the non-uniformed service have equal opportunity to undergo schooling/ training/ seminars locally and abroad and to receive benefits granted to their counterparts in the uniform service.	4.33	Fully implemented
32. The agency conducts gender awareness and sensitivity trainings.	4.44	Fully implemented
Weighted Mean	4.26	Fully implemented
Republic Act 8551 “An Act Providing for the Reform and Reorganization of the Philippine National Police and for other Purposes,	4.38	Fully implemented



Amending Certain Provisions of RA No. 6975”		
33. The agency prioritizes the recruitment and training of women who shall serve in the women's desk.	4.38	Fully implemented
Overall Weighted Mean	4.36	Fully implemented

The Perceived Attitudes of Male and Female Respondents towards Their Counterparts.

Table 9 shows that male respondents ‘agree’ that they are more capable of occupying higher positions in the law enforcement (i-1) and that they are more capable of the job in the law enforcement (i-4) with the mean of 3.51 and 3.60 respectively. Moreover, they ‘neither agree nor disagree’ on the issue that female officers are more likely to experience insubordination (i-2) and on whether female officers are more respectable than them (i-3) with means of 3.11 and 3.13 respectively. On the other hand, the female respondents ‘neither agree nor disagree’ on all the given indicators. This implies that the female officers still have the stigma of stereotyping by male officers in the field of law enforcement profession while the females remain to be rather silent to profess equality or neutrality.

Table 9. The Perceived Attitudes of Male and Female Law Enforcers towards Their Counterparts

Attitude Indicators	Male Respondents		Female Respondents	
	Mean	Description	Mean	Description
1. I believe that males are more capable of occupying higher positions in the law enforcement agency.	3.51	Agree	3.07	Neither agree nor disagree
2. I think that female officers are more likely to experience insubordination.	3.11	Neither agree nor disagree	3.12	Neither agree nor disagree
3. I consider female officers more respectable than male officers.	3.13	Neither agree nor disagree	3.31	Neither agree nor disagree
4. Male police officers are more capable of the job in the law enforcement.	3.60	Agree	3.16	Neither agree nor disagree

CONCLUSIONS

Based on the findings of the study, it is concluded that the Philippine National Police is generally compliant to the provisions of Gender and Development as assessed by the Police Non-Commissioned Officers, Women Police Service, Non-uniformed Personnel and as evaluated by the middle level managers such as the Chiefs of Police, and Branch Chiefs.



In spite of this, there are areas on its implementation which need improvement. First, most GAD activities in PNP cater to civilian recipients. Second, there is not enough number of women representatives during planning sessions in the agency. Third, women have very limited participation in their women's club. Fourth, there are insufficient avenues through which the other talents and skills of the male PNCOs can be utilized and recognized. Fifth, men in PNP Cagayan think of themselves superior to women when it comes to handling jobs in PNP. Sixth, there is difficulty in downloading GAD Funds in the agency. Seventh, the officers managing the Gender and Development activities of the agency lack training. And eighth, the agency does not implement policies which specifically address GAD issues.

RECOMMENDATIONS

The researchers recommend that the agency should continue its present implementation of Gender and Development, but to apply the following measures in order to improve the GAD mainstreaming in the agency. First, GAD programs and activities should also focus on the needs of PNP employees and not only to civilian beneficiaries. Second, women should be more empowered through increased participation in planning. Third, organizations within PNP such as the Women's Club should engage its members more to address their concerns. Fourth, male PNCOs should be given opportunities to productively share their talent and skills as needed. Fifth, gender sensitivity trainings should focus on how the members understand their significant roles and equal contributions to the agency's vision and mission. Sixth, the agency must develop a procedure if not strictly and immediately implement procedures on the disbursement of GAD Funds. Seventh, the agency should conduct trainings to help GAD Officers improve Gender and Development planning and mainstreaming. And eighth, the GAD Office should set policies specific to the needs of PNP Cagayan with respect to the Gender and Development mainstreaming.

BIBLIOGRAPHY

1. (AAWORD) Association of African Women for Research on Development, ed. 1983. Seminar on research on African women: what type of methodology? AAWORD, Dakar, Senegal.
2. Abu-Lughod, L. 1990. The romance of resistance: tracing transformations of power through Bedouin women. *In* Sanday, P.R.; Goodenough, R.G., ed., *Beyond the second sex: new directions in the anthropology of gender*. University of



- Pennsylvania Press, Philadelphia, PA, USA. pp. 311-338.
3. Agarwal, B. 1991. Engendering the environment debate: lessons from the Indian subcontinent. Center for Advanced Study of International Development, Michigan State University, East Lansing, MI, USA. CASE) Distinguished Speaker Series, No. 8.
 4. Alvarez, S. 1989. Women's movements and gender politics in the Brazilian transition. *In* Jacquette, J., ed., *The women's movement in Latin America*. Unwin Hyman, Boston, MA, USA. pp. 13-64.
 5. Amadiume, I. 1987. *Male daughters, female husbands: gender and class in an African society*. Zed Books, London, UK.
 6. Amin, S. 1974. *Accumulation on a world scale*. Harvester Press, Brighton, Sussex, UK.
 7. Arizpe, L.; Aranda, J. 1981. The comparative advantages of women's disadvantages: women workers in the strawberry export agribusiness in Mexico. *SIGNS*, 7(2), 453-473.
 8. Armstrong, P. 1993. The feminization of the labour force: harmonizing down in a global economy. Paper presented at the North-South Institute Conference on Structural Change and Gender Relations in the Era of Globalization, Ottawa, ON, Canada.
 9. Asad, T., ed. 1973. *Anthropology and the colonial encounter*. Athlone Press, London, UK.
 10. Barribeau, V.E. 1992. The construct of a post-modernist feminist theory for Caribbean social science research. *Social and Economic Studies*, 41(2), 143.
 11. Beneria, L.; Feldman, S., ed. 1992. *Unequal burden: economic crisis, persistent poverty and women's work*. Westview Press, Boulder, CO, USA.
 12. Bernal, M. 1987. *Black Athena: Afroasiatic roots of classical civilization*. Vol. 1: *The fabrication of ancient Greece*. Free Association Press, London, UK.
 13. Bernstein, H. 1979. African peasantries: a theoretical framework. *Journal of Peasant Studies*, 6(4), 77-106.
 14. Bienefeld, M. 1993. Structural adjustment: debt collection device or development policy? Institute of Comparative Culture, Sophia University, Tokyo, Japan. *Advanced Development Management Program Series*, No. 5.
 15. Blomstrom, M.; Hettne, B. 1984. *Development theory in transition*. Zed Books, London, UK.



16. Borque, S.; Warren, K. 1990. Access is not enough: gender perspectives on technology and education. *In* Tinker, L, ed., *Persistent inequalities*. Oxford University Press, New York, NY, USA. pp. 83-100.
17. Boserup, E. 1970. *Women's role in economic development*. Allen & Unwin, London, UK.
18. Bourdieu, P. 1977. *Outline of a theory of practice*. Cambridge University Press, Cambridge, UK.
19. Bozzoli, B.; Nkotsoe, M. 1991. *Women of Phokeng*. Heinemann, Portsmouth, NH, USA.
20. Brodrigg, S. 1992. *Nothing mat(t)ers: a feminist critique of postmodernism*. James Lorimer and Co., Toronto, ON, Canada.
21. Brydon, L.; Chant, S. 1989. *Women in the Third World: gender issues in rural and urban areas*. Rutgers University Press, New Brunswick, NJ, USA.
22. Bunch, C; Carrillo, R. 1990. *Feminist perspectives on women in development*. *In* Tinker, I, ed., *Persistent inequalities*. Oxford University Press, New York, NY, USA. pp. 70-82.
23. Burgos-Debray, E., ed. 1984. *I, Rigoberta Menchu: an Indian woman in Guatemala* (transl. by A. Wright). Verso, New York, NY, USA.
24. Butler, J.; Scott, J., ed. 1992. *Feminists theorize the political*. Routledge, New York, NY, USA.
25. Canning, K. 1994. *Feminist history after the linguistic turn: historicizing discourse and experience*. *SIGNS*, 19(2), 368-404.
26. Chambers, R. 1983. *Rural development: putting the last first*. Longman, Harlow, UK.
27. Coady International Institute. (1989). *A Handbook for Social/Gender Analysis*. Ottawa: Social and Human Resources Development Division, Canadian International Development Assistance (CIDA). Reference Manual, Exercise Manual, and Trainer's Manual
28. Collins, P. 1989. *The social construction of black feminist thought*. *SIGNS*, 14(4), 745-773.
29. Comaroff, J.; Comaroff, J. 1992. *Ethnography and the historical imagination*. Westview Press, Boulder, CO, USA.
30. Corbridge, S. 1990. *Post-Marxism and development studies: beyond the impasse*.



- World Development, 8(5), 623-640.
31. Comia, G.A.; Jolly, R.; Stewart, F. 1987. Adjustment with a human face: protecting the vulnerable and promoting growth. Clarendon Press, Oxford, UK.
 32. CRC (Combahee River Collective). 1982. A black feminist statement. *In* Hull, G.T.; Scott, P.B.; Smith, B., ed., All the women are white, all the blacks are men. The Feminist Press at City University of New York, New York, NY, USA. pp. 13-22.
 33. CSEGWSA (Commonwealth Secretariat Expert Group on Women and Structural Adjustment). 1989. Engendering adjustment for the 1990s. Commonwealth Secretariat, London, UK.
 34. Dixon, M. 1980. Women in class struggle. Synthesis Publications, San Francisco, CA, USA.
 35. DuBois, M. 1991. The governance of the Third World: a Foucauldian perspective on power relations in development. *Alternatives*, 16(1), 1-30.
 36. Edwards, M. 1989. The irrelevance of development studies. *Third World Quarterly*, 11(1), 116-135.
 37. Elson, D. 1992. From survival strategies to transformation strategies: women's needs and structural adjustment. *In* Beneria, L.; Feldman, S., ed., Unequal burden: economic crises, persistent poverty, and women's work. Westview Press, Boulder, CO, USA. pp. 26-48.
 38. Engels, F. 1970. Origin of the family, private property, and the state. International Publishers, New York, NY, USA.
 39. Escobar, A. 1984. Discourse and power in development: Michel Foucault and the relevance of his work to the Third World. *Alternatives*, 10(3), 377-400.
 40. Eviota, E. 1992. The political economy of gender: women and the sexual division of labour in the Philippines. Zed Books, London, UK.
 41. Ferguson, J. 1990. The antipolitics machine. Cambridge University Press, Cambridge, UK.
 42. Findji, M. 1992. From resistance to social movement: the indigenous authorities movement in Columbia. *In* Escobar, A.; Alvarez, S., ed. 9 The making of social movements in Latin America. Westview Press, Boulder, CO, USA.
 43. Firestone, S. 1970. The dialectic of sex: the case for feminist revolution. William Morrow, New York, NY, USA.
 44. Flax, J. 1990. Thinking fragments: psychoanalysis, feminism and post-modernism in



- the contemporary West. University of California, Berkeley, CA, USA.
45. Foucault, M. 1980. Power/knowledge. Harvester, Brighton, Sussex, UK.
 46. Frank, A.G. 1967. Capitalism and underdevelopment in Latin America. Monthly Review Press, New York, NY, USA.
 47. Fraser, N.; Nicholson, L. 1990. Social criticism without philosophy: an encounter between feminism and post-modernism. *In* Nicholson, L., ed., *Feminism/post-modernism*. Routledge, New York, NY, USA. pp. 19-38.
 48. Giddens, A. 1979. Central problems in social theory. Macmillan, London, UK.
 49. Gilligan, C. 1982. *In a different voice: psychological theory and women's development*. Harvard University Press, Cambridge, MA, USA.
 50. Gladwin, C.H. 1993. Women and structural adjustment in a global economy. *In* Gallin, R.S.; Ferguson, A.; Harper, J., ed., *The women and international development annual*. Vol. 3. Westview Press, Boulder, CO, USA. pp. 87-114.
 51. Harding, S., ed. 1987. *Feminism and methodology*. Open University; Indiana University Press, Bloomington, IN, USA.
 52. Hartmann, H. 1981. The unhappy marriage of Marxism and feminism: towards a more progressive union. *In* Sargent, L., ed., *Women and revolution: a discussion of the unhappy marriage of Marxism and feminism*. South End Press, Boston, MA, USA. pp. 1-42.
 53. Hennessy, R. 1993. *Of Materialist feminism and the politics discourse*. Routledge, New York, NY, USA.
 54. Heyser, N., ed. 1987. *Women farmers and rural change in Asia*. Asian and Pacific Development Centre, Kuala Lumpur, Malaysia.
 55. Hill, P. 1986. *Development economics on trial: the anthropological case for the prosecution*. Cambridge University Press, Cambridge, UK.
 56. hooks, b. 1988. *Talking back: thinking feminist, thinking black*. Between the Lines, Toronto, ON, Canada.
 57. Imam, A. 1994. Politics, Islam, and women in Kano, northern Nigeria. *In* Moghadam, V.M., ed., *Identity politics and women: cultural reassertions and feminisms in international perspective*. Westview Press, Boulder, CO, USA. pp. 123-144.
 58. Institute for Development Studies (IDS). (1992). *Gender and World Development*. Sussex, England: University of Sussex.



59. Irigaray, L. 1985. *Speculum of the other woman*. Cornell, Ithaca, NY, USA.
60. Jaggar, A. 1983. *Feminist politics and human nature*. Rowman and Allanheld, Totowa, NJ, USA.
61. James, S.; Busia, A. 1993. *Theorizing black feminisms*. Routledge, London, UK.
62. Jaquette, J. 1982. Women and modernization theory: a decade of feminist criticism. *World Politics*, 34(2), 267-284.
63. Jelin, E. 1980. The Bahiana in the labor force in Salvador, Brazil. *In* Nash, J.; Safa, H., ed., *Sex and class in Latin America*. Bergin Publishers, South Hadley, MA, USA. pp. 129-146.
64. Kalekar, M. 1991. *Voices from within: early personal narratives of Bengali women*. Oxford University Press, New Delhi, India.
65. King, D.K. 1988. Multiple jeopardy, multiple consciousness: the context of a black feminist ideology. *SIGNS*, 14(1), 42-72.
66. Kirby, S.; McKenna, K. 1989. *Experience, research, social change: methods from the margins*. Garamond Press, Toronto, ON, Canada.
67. Kishwar, M.; Vanita, R., ed. 1984. *In search of answers: Indian women's voices from Manushi*. Zed Books, London, UK.
68. Kumar, R. 1994. Identity politics and the contemporary Indian feminist movement. *In* Moghadam, V.M., ed., *Identity politics and women: cultural reassertions and feminisms in international perspective*. Westview Press, Boulder, CO, USA. pp. 274-292.
69. Lazreg, M. 1988. Feminism and difference: the perils of writing as a woman on women in Algeria. *Feminist Studies*, 14(1), 81-107.
70. Lele, S.M. 1991. Sustainable development: a critical review. *World Development*, 19(6), 607-622.
71. Lerner, D. 1958. *The passing of traditional society*. The Free Press, New York, NY, USA.
72. Lewis, A. 1955. *The theory of economic growth*. Allen & Unwin, Ltd, London, UK.
73. Lorde, A. 1984. The master's tools will never dismantle the master's house. *In* Lorde, A., ed., *Sister outsider: essays and speeches*. Crossing Press, Trumansburg, NY, USA.
74. Maguire, P. 1987. *Doing participatory research: a feminist approach*. University of Massachusetts, Boston, MA, USA.



75. Mazumdar, V.; Sharma, K. 1990. Sexual division of labor and the subordination of women: a reappraisal from India. *In* Tinker, I., ed, *Persistent inequalities*. Oxford University Press, Oxford, UK. pp. 185-197.
76. Mbilinyi, M. 1984. *Cooperation or exploitation? Experiences of women's initiatives in Tanzania*. International Labour Office, Geneva, Switzerland.
77. Meena, R. 1991. The impact of structural adjustment programs on rural women in Tanzania. *In* Gladwin, C., ed., *Structural adjustment and African women farmers*. University of Florida Press, Gainesville, FL, USA. pp. 169-190.
78. Mernissi, F. 1987. *Beyond the veil: male-female dynamics in modern Muslim society (rev. ed.)*. University of Indiana Press, Bloomington, IN, USA.
79. Mies, M. 1989. *Patriarchy and accumulation on a world scale*. Zed Books, London, UK. Mies, M.; Shiva, V. 1993. *Ecofeminism*. Zed Books, London, UK.
80. Minh-ha, T. 1989. *Woman, native, other*. Indiana University Press, Bloomington, IN, USA.
81. Mitchell, J. 1984. *Women: the longest revolution: essays on feminism, literature and psychoanalysis*. Virago, London, UK.
82. Moffat, L.; Geadah, Y.; Stuart, R. 1991. *Two halves make a whole: balancing gender relations hi development*. Canadian Council for International Co-operation, MATCH International Centre; Association quebecoise des organismes de co-operation Internationale, Ottawa, ON, Canada.
83. Mohanty, C.; Russo, A.; Torres, L., ed. 1992. *Third World women and the politics of feminism*. University of Indiana Press, Bloomington, IN, USA.
84. Molyneux, M. 1985. Mobilization without emancipation: women's interests, state and revolution in Nicaragua. *Feminist Studies*, 11(2), 227-254.
85. Moser, C. 1989. Gender planning hi the third world: meeting practical and strategic needs. *World Development*, 17(11), 1799-1825.
86. Moser, Caroline O.N. (1993). *Gender Planning and Development: Theory, Practice and Training*. New York: Routledge,
87. Mukabi-Kabira, J.; Wanjiku, A.-O.; Nzomo, M., ed. 1993. *Democratic change hi Africa: women's perspective*. Association of African Women for Research and Development; African Centre for Technology Studies, Nairobi, Kenya.
88. Mukherjee, P. 1978. *Hindu women: normative models*. Orient Longmans, New Delhi, India.



89. Mumtaz, K. 1994. Identity politics and women: "fundamentalism" and women in Pakistan. *In* Moghadam, V.M., ed., *Identity politics and women: cultural reassertions and feminisms in international perspective*. Westview Press, Boulder, CO, USA. pp. 228-242.
90. Narayan, U. 1989. The project of feminist epistemology: perspectives from a nonwestern feminist. *In* Jaggar, A.; Bordo, S., ed., *Gender/body/knowledge*. Rutgers University Press, New Brunswick, NJ, USA. pp. 256-272.
91. Ng, C. 1985. Gender and the division of labour: a case study. *In* Ai Yun, H.; Talib, R., ed., *Women and employment in Malaysia*. The Asia and Pacific Development Centre, Kuala Lumpur, Malaysia, pp. 82-122.
92. Nicholson, L., ed. 1990. *Feminism/postmodernism*. Routledge, New York, NY, USA.
93. Nzomo, M. 1993. Political and legal empowerment of women in post-election Kenya. *In* Nzomo, M., ed., *Empowering Kenya women*. National Commission on the Status of Women, Nairobi, Kenya, pp. 6-19.
94. Okeke, P. 1994. Patriarchal continuities and contradictions in African women's education and socio-economic status: ethnographic study of university educated Igbo women in Nigeria. Dalhousie University, Halifax, NS, Canada. PhD thesis.
95. Oppong, C., ed. 1983. *Female and male in West Africa*. Allen & Unwin, London, UK.
96. Overholt, C.; Anderson, M.; Cloud, K.; Austin, J., ed. 1984. *Gender roles in development*. Kumarian Press, West Hartford, CT, USA.
97. Parpart, J., ed. 1989. *Women and development in Africa: comparative perspectives*. University Press of America, Lanham, MD, USA.
98. Parsons, T. 1951. *The social system*. Routledge, London, UK.
99. Perez-Aleman, P. 1992. Economic crisis and women in Nicaragua. *In* Lourdes, B.; Feldman, S., ed., *Unequal burden: economic crises, persistent poverty and women's work*. Westview Press, Boulder, CO, USA. pp. 239-258.
100. Pietila, H.; Vickers, J. 1990. *Making women matter: the role of the United Nations*. Zed Books, London, UK.
101. Radcliffe, S.; Westwood, S., ed. 1993. *Viva: women and popular protest in Latin America*. Routledge, London, UK.
102. Rajan, R. 1993. *Real and imagined women*. Routledge, London, UK.
103. Rao, Aruna, Mary B. Anderson, & Catherine A. Overholt. (Eds.). (1991). *Gender Analysis in Development Planning*. West Hartford, CT: Kumarian Press.



104. Risseuw, C. 1988. *The fish don't talk about the water: gender transformation, power and resistance among women in Sri Lanka*. E.J. Brill, Leiden, Netherlands.
105. Sangari, K.; Vaid, S. 1989. *Recasting women: essays in colonial history*. Kali for Women, New Delhi, India.
106. Sargent, L. 1981. *Women and revolution*. South End Press, Boston, MA, USA.
107. Shiva, V. 1988. *Staying alive: women, ecology and survival*. Kali for Women, Delhi, India.
108. Steady, F.C. 1983. *Research methodology and investigative framework for social change: the case for African women*. Association of African Women for Research on Development (AAWORD), ed., *Seminar on research on African women: what type of methodology?* AAWORD, Dakar, Senegal, pp. 12-21.
109. Sudarkasa, N. 1973. *Where women work: a study of Yoruba women in the marketplace and the home*. Museum of Anthropology, University of Michigan, Ann Arbor, MI, USA. *Anthropological Papers*, No. 53.
110. Sylvester, C. 1994. *Feminist theory and international relations in a postmodern era*. Cambridge University Press, Cambridge, UK.
111. Tadria, H. 1993. *Gender issues in management development: an African paradigm*. In von Troil, M., ed., *Changing paradigms in development — South, East and West*. Nordiska Afrikainstitutet, Uppsala, Sweden.
112. Thomson, S.; Sarikahputi, Y. 1989. *Integration of rural women's concerns into mainstream agriculture and rural development activities*. *Quarterly Newsletter*, 4(3).
113. Tiano, S. 1990. *Maquiladora women: a category of workers?* In Ward, K., ed., *Women workers and global restructuring*. ILR Press, New York, NY, USA. pp. 193-224.
114. Tinker, I. 1990. *Persistent inequalities*. Oxford University Press, New York, NY, USA.
115. United Nations. 1991. *The world's women 1970-1990: trends and statistics*. United Nations Publications, New York, NY, USA.
116. Vargas, V. 1992. *The feminist movement in Latin America: between hope and disenchantment*. *Development and Change*, 23(3), 195-214.
117. Vickers, J. 1991. *Women and the world economic crisis*. Zed Books, London, UK.
118. Viswanath, V. 1991. *NGOs and women's development in rural South India: a comparative analysis*. Westview Press, Boulder, CO, USA.



119. Wilber, C.K.; Jameson, K.P. 1984. Paradigms of economic development and beyond. *In* Wilber, C.K., ed., *The political economy of development and underdevelopment*. Random House, New York, NY, USA.
120. Wollstonecraft, M. 1792. *A vindication of the rights of women with strictures on political and moral subjects*. Peter Edes, Boston, MA, USA.
121. Wood, G. 1985. The politics of development policy labelling. *Development and Change*, 16, 347-373.
122. Young, K.; Walkowitz, C.; McCullagh, R., ed. 1981. *Of marriage and the market*. University of California Press, Berkeley, CA, USA.
123. Appendix B/Page 92 CEDPA/Gender and Development